

**Economic Empowerment of Women & Girls
in a Sustainable Development Perspective**
FORUM - 10 October 2016 - Palais des Nations, Geneva

act | advance | achieve | women's rights!

Forum Report



Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft
Confédération suisse
Confederazione Svizzera
Confederaziun svizra

Federal Department of Foreign Affairs FDFA
Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation SDC

Introduction

Background & Purpose

After a two year process of negotiations with an unprecedented participation of Civil Society, a new development agenda, “Transforming Our World: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development”, has been adopted by the leaders of the world at the United Nations Summit on September 25-27, 2015. This new agenda is ambitious in its scope and purpose: end poverty by 2030 and promote shared economic prosperity, social development and environmental protection for all countries. It is based on 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), that include a **stand-alone goal (Goal 5) to “Achieve gender equality and the empowerment all women and girls”**, as well as gender sensitive targets and indicators in all the other goals.

The NGO Committee on the Status of Women, Geneva (NGO CSW Geneva) wanted to give **impetus to Goal 5** to achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls through transformative economic, social and political measures, while also recognizing that all the other SDGs are closely intertwined with Goal 5. As noted by UN Women in a policy brief, **“Investing in women’s economic empowerment sets a direct path towards gender equality, poverty eradication and inclusive economic growth”**.

The Forum therefore **focused on practical means to foster the Economic Empowerment of women and girls**, and discussed 4 interrelated topics which were selected as particularly relevant to achieve greater gender equity in the economic sphere, and thus improve the economic and social situation of women and girls around the world:

- **Women in decision-making positions:** bringing more women in leadership and decision-making positions in all sectors and at every level is not only a matter of equality: it has the potential to positively change the perspectives, the culture and the performances of any organization;
- **Equal pay for men and women:** the gender wage gap remains high, with globally women still earning on average 77% of what men earn, a discrimination that contributes to the feminization of poverty;
- **Unpaid care work:** the unequal sharing between men and women of domestic tasks and caring responsibilities is now well recognized as a human rights issue and a structural cause of gender inequalities that must be addressed;
- **Government procurement:** representing a significant part of GDP in most countries, government procurement can effectively be used to promote women-led business enterprises, and more generally gender equality.

Objectives

The main objectives of the one-day Forum, which took place on 10 October 2016 in Room XIX in the Palais des Nations in Geneva were:

1. **To contribute to the realization of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development** by focusing on key obstacles for the economic empowerment of women and girls
2. **To provide examples of effective solutions (“best practices”)** in different countries for each of the selected topics, i.e. policies and legislation that have been effective in addressing women’s underrepresentation in decision making, the Gender Pay Gap and the issue of Unpaid Care Work, as well as policies for using government procurement as a driver to greater Gender equality.

The NGO CSW Geneva wishes to thank the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) for its support as well as all the speakers for their valuable contributions in the Panel.

Program

10:00 am – 10:30 am: Opening Statements

- **Michael Møller**, Director-General of the United Nations Office at Geneva (UNOG)
- **Simone Ovard**, President of the NGO CSW Geneva and UN Representative for ZONTA International
- **Chantal Oltramare**, Programme Manager, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC)

10:30 am – 11:45 am: Panel on Government Procurement

Convener: **Oleksandra Kunovska Mondoux**, Main UN Representative, World Federation of Ukrainian Women's Organizations (WFUWO)

Moderator: **Anna Caroline Müller**, Legal Affairs Officer, Government procurement team of the WTO

Panelists:

- **Meg Jones**, Chief, Economic Empowerment, UN Women
- **Vanessa Erogbogbo**, Head of the women and trade programme, International Trade Center (ITC)
- **Tetiana Lisovska**, Head of Division of the Public Procurement Regulation Department of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine
- **Dr. Steve Binggeli**, Economist, Federal Office for Gender Equality (FOGE), Switzerland

11:45 am – 1:00 pm: Panel on Equal Pay between Men and Women

Convener: **Véronique Goy Veenhuys**, Founder & CEO, EQUAL-SALARY Foundation

Moderator: **Mary Farmer**, Professor, Leading Women program, Copenhagen Business School

Panelists:

- **Pascale Vielle**, Professor of Law at Université de Louvain, Scientific collaborator at Université Libre de Bruxelles
- **Sonja Hönig**, President, Zonta International
- **Véronique Goy Veenhuys**, Founder & CEO, EQUAL-SALARY Foundation
- **Raquel Blanc Gutiérrez**, Vice President Diversity & Inclusiveness, Philip Morris Intl.

3:00 pm – 4:15 pm: Panel on Women in Decision Making Positions

Convener & Moderator: **Catherine Bosshart-Pflugger**, Executive Secretary, International Federation of Business and Professional Women (BPW International)

Panelists:

- **Eelco Wierda**, researcher Atria Institut, Amsterdam
- **Thannaletchimy Housset**, Gender Expert of the International Organization of Employers
- **Regula Kuhn Hammer**, EDA KUG
- **Frances Raday**, Expert member, UN Working Group on Discrimination against Women in Law and Practice

4:15 pm – 5:30 pm: Panel on Addressing Unpaid Care Work

Convener & Moderator: **Valerie Bichelmeier**, Main UN Representative, Make Mothers Matter (MMM)

Panelists:

- **Valeria Esquivel**, Senior Advisor, Social Policy and Gender, Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO)
- **Paola Panzeri**, Senior Policy and Advocacy officer for Employment, Gender equality & Migration, COFACE – Families Europe
- **Antoine de Gabrielli**, Founder & CEO Companieros, Founder Happy Men Network
- **Zahrah Nesbitt-Ahmed**, Research Fellow, Institute for Development Studies (IDS)

5:30 pm – 6:00 pm: Closing Remarks

- **Sylvie Durrer**, Director, Swiss Federal Office for Gender Equality (FOGE)

Opening Remarks

M. Michael Møller, Director-General of the United Nations Office at Geneva (UNOG)

Ladies and gentlemen:

I am very pleased to be with you today for this important discussion on the Economic Empowerment of Women and Girls in a Sustainable Development Perspective. I am grateful to the Committee on the Status of Women (CSW) for organizing this timely Forum here in Geneva.

The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development alongside the three other major accords of last year on disaster risk reduction, financing for development and on climate change is our collective road map for the next 15 years and possibly beyond. These agreements would not have been possible without the active contribution of civil society, who will also play a major role in the implementation. As part of this process, the Committee on the Status of Women is doing important work to help governments implement their commitments on gender equality. And you are absolutely right in identifying the Sustainable Development Goals as a major opportunity to go the last mile towards gender equality.

The Millennium Development Goals helped us to make progress and improved the lives of many women and girls across the world. For example, today women make up 41 per cent of the paid work force outside of agriculture, compared to 35 percent in 1990. But 41% isn't 50% and we still have important steps to take to achieve our targets in employment and in other areas.

Sustainable Development Goal 5 sets out the direction to "achieve gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls" by 2030. The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development can get us there, because it recognizes gender equality as a cross-cutting issue. Without progress on gender equality, goals on health, education, reduced inequalities and others will not be achievable.

To ensure that this is followed by action, we need to promote change right here, in International Geneva. As the operational hub of the international system, actors across Geneva have key expertise for the implementation of these goals. We are continuously working to adopt a horizontal approach in order to tackle interconnected issues linked to development, gender being one of them.

That is why, together with the Permanent Representative of the USA and the NGO Women@TheTable, I launched the Geneva Gender Champions network last year. This network brings together leaders of organizations from Permanent Missions to International Organizations, NGOs and private companies. Each of the more than 110 Gender Champions signs up to the panel parity pledge by which we strive for equal representation at panel discussions in Geneva. And everyone makes two more concrete commitments to promote gender equality in their institution or in their programmatic work. At UNOG, we have for example developed a new gender policy. That was my first commitment. And to add to these efforts, just last week, UN Women opened a new liaison office in Geneva. So, we are working and continuing to push.

The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development is very ambitious. But change requires ambition. When women demanded the right to vote, in many countries, they were laughed at. Today equal rights to vote are the norm. Gender equality has to stop just being an ambition! It has to become a reality. Your presence here today and the focus on exchanging effective solutions at this gathering shows your strong commitment to this cause. I know that at the UN, we can count on your support in making the Sustainable Development Goals known to everyone, and making sure that their benefits reach everyone, regardless of their gender. You can count on our support too.

I wish you a fruitful conference. Thank you very much.

Opening Statement

Ms. Chantal Oltramare, Programme Manager, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation

Monsieur le Directeur Général de l'Office des Nations Unies à Genève,
Madame la Présidente du Comité ONG de la Condition de la femme à Genève,
Mesdames, Messieurs,

C'est un grand plaisir de vous accueillir aujourd'hui pour parler d'un thème central : la participation économique des femmes et des filles dans une perspective de développement durable. Comme vous le savez, bien que nous soyons en 2016, l'égalité des sexes n'existe dans aucun pays. Ce fait est difficile à accepter surtout lorsque nous pensons aux parcours et sacrifices des femmes engagées pour obtenir la dignité et les droits qui les respectent.

Nombre d'entre vous ont sûrement vu le film intitulé les suffragettes qui rappelle avec force le combat des femmes en Angleterre au début du 20ème siècle qui se sont battues pour l'obtention du droit de vote. C'est la génération de nos grands-mères. Plusieurs ont perdu leur travail, leur maison, leurs enfants et même leur vie alors qu'elles demandaient la participation aux décisions politiques. Tant de femmes subissent encore des violences parce qu'elles demandent le respect, une place égale et revendiquent leurs droits. Nous devons poursuivre nos efforts sans relâche.

Sur le plan international, la Suisse s'est fortement mobilisée pour promouvoir et soutenir l'objectif de développement durable relatif à l'égalité des sexes et à l'autonomisation (empowerment) de toutes les femmes et les filles. Il importait aussi d'intégrer la dimension genre à travers tous les autres objectifs de l'Agenda 2030 tant les questions sont liées. La Suisse s'est aussi engagée pour la prise en compte de la dimension genre dans le Programme d'action d'Addis-Abeba qui offre un cadre mondial pour le financement du développement durable. Pour traduire cet engagement en action, nous appuyons le plan d'action pour des financements transformateurs pour l'égalité des sexes et l'autonomisation des femmes en coopération avec ONU femmes et d'autres Etats membres.

A travers la coopération multilatérale et bilatérale, la Suisse soutient la mise en œuvre des normes internationales et la collecte de données telles que celles présentes dans le rapport du Groupe de la Banque Mondiale intitulé « Les Femmes, l'Entreprise et le Droit ». Selon ce rapport, on dénombre 943 différences de traitement juridique entre hommes et femmes dans les 173 économies étudiées. Dans 100 économies, les femmes se heurtent à des restrictions à l'emploi fondées sur le sexe. Dans 18 économies, le mari peut légalement empêcher sa femme de travailler. Ceci montre l'urgence des réformes législatives et juridiques pour mettre fin à toute discrimination.

L'Agenda 2030 met en avant l'importance des partenariats pour parvenir à la réalisation des objectifs de développement durable. Ces partenariats impliquent tant le secteur public que le secteur privé, la société civile, les milieux académiques ainsi que les institutions onusiennes et internationales. Nous nous réjouissons que cette diversité soit présente aujourd'hui à travers la riche expérience de chaque participante et participants.

Nous avons accueilli avec grande satisfaction le bureau de liaison d'ONU Femmes auprès de l'Office des Nations Unies à Genève. Cet ancrage d'ONU Femmes permettra de renforcer les partenariats et les échanges avec les différents acteurs présents à Genève et d'appuyer l'engagement des Etats membres pour l'intégration de la dimension genre dans les processus inter-gouvernementaux.



Les quatre thèmes que nous abordons aujourd’hui, soit les marchés publics, un salaire égal pour un travail de valeur égale, la participation des femmes à la prise de décision et le travail de soins non rémunéré sont des thèmes essentiels pour la réalisation de l’autonomisation économique des femmes. Cette réalisation ne peut toutefois se faire sans un accès à une éducation de qualité et à la protection des droits liés à la santé sexuelle et reproductive.

Montrer les approches qui fonctionnent permet de dire que c’est possible d’agir au niveau des politiques et au niveau des entreprises avec des répercussions tant nationales qu’internationales pour l’autonomisation des femmes. Cela permet aussi de convaincre les sceptiques et d’inclure toujours plus d’hommes et de femmes pour des solutions durables.

Le Panel de haut niveau du Secrétaire Général des Nations Unies sur l’autonomisation économique des femmes s’inscrit dans cette démarche. L’ensemble des réflexions et engagements partagés par le Panel contribuera également aux discussions de la prochaine session de la Commission de la Condition de la femme dont le thème est l’autonomisation économique des femmes dans le monde du travail en mutation.

Comme le dit les Nations Unies « Garantir l’égalité d’accès des femmes et des filles à l’éducation, aux soins de santé, à un travail décent et à la représentation dans les processus de prise de décisions politiques et économiques nourrira l’instauration d’économies durables et sera bénéfique aux sociétés et à l’ensemble de l’humanité. »

Je vous remercie.

Panel on Government Procurement

Transparency and Equality in the Government Procurement Markets: Opportunities and Challenges for Women's Business Enterprises

Moderator: Anna Caroline Müller, Legal Affairs Officer, Government procurement team of the WTO

Panelists:

- **Meg Jones**, Chief, Economic Empowerment, UN Women
- **Vanessa Erogbogbo**, Head of the women and trade programme, International Trade Center (ITC)
- **Tetiana Lisovska**, Head of Division of the Public Procurement Regulation Department of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine
- **Dr. Steve Binggeli**, Economist, Federal Office for Gender Equality (FOGE), Switzerland

Convener & Rapporteur: Oleksandra Kunovska Mondoux, Main UN Representative, World Federation of Ukrainian Women's Organizations

Context

Women's economic empowerment is a priority on the world agenda today, with respect to the new Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Instead of experiencing great achievements and confirmation of excellence, women remain economically disadvantaged in different parts of the world. A possible measure to help changing this situation is to promote procurement from women's business enterprises (WBEs) to support gender equality and inclusive growth.

In April 2014, the revised version of the 1994 Agreement on Government Procurement (GPA) came into force, and 46 member countries of The World Trade Organization (WTO) adhere to it. This revised Agreement has the potential to open up significant economic opportunities to WBEs in the public procurement segment, which represents approximately 15% of the GDP in developed and developing countries. The GPA is an important trade-opening instrument, focused around the WTO's fundamental principles of non-discrimination, transparency and procedural fairness, which foster equal access to public procurement markets and recognize the necessity for good governance mechanisms.

The revised GPA takes into account new technological developments, encouraging the use of electronic tools to facilitate procurement and to provide open information on procurement opportunities to all economic actors, especially for women owners. The new text of the GPA equally clarifies the Special and Differential treatment provisions (S&D) for developing countries, permitting them to gradually liberate their markets and thereby stimulating efficiency of domestic industries.

A new requirement of the revised GPA concerns the prevention of conflicts of interest and corrupt practices for participating governments, in order to promote good governance and fair opportunities for women to compete. A transparent and corruption-free environment is particularly important for WBEs that come to procurement markets dominated by businesses deep-rooted through networking channels. Thereby, the GPA's procedural requirement helps to create transparent and impartial procurement schemes, including for women business owners in developed and developing economies.

The **objective** of this panel is to analyze how the GPA can reinforce the position of WBEs in national and international trade, to eliminate the remaining discriminatory measures, and have a beneficial impact on gender equality and socio-economic development of women. It is particularly important to focus on the following measures:

- To provide information and guarantee non-discriminative procedures of government procurement markets
- To ensure that government procurement is performed in a transparent, non-corruptive and competitive manner that does not discriminate against WBEs

- To increase participation of WBEs in preferential programs without limiting their benefits to national procurement markets
- To support general training courses preparing WBEs for effective participation in national and international procurement
- To encourage WBEs to bid for subcontracts, to learn from other enterprises and increase their experience
- To reinforce the use of electronic technology, to accelerate women’s participation in the global digital economy
 - Analysis of electronic platforms and tools for public procurement, such as Logib (CH), ProZorro (Ukraine)
 - Presentation of the ITC unique platform “SheTrades”



Anna Caroline Müller, Legal Affairs Officer in the government procurement team of the WTO, Moderator

How Government procurement can be related to Women’s Economic Empowerment?

- There are different processes that allow to facilitate access of women-owned businesses (WOBs) to Government procurement
- WTO has an Agreement on Government Procurement (Ukraine and Switzerland take part)
- Government procurement is important part of economy that amounts to 20% in developing economy
- Government procurement has to serve a catalyser and link between public and private sectors
- A lot of procurements are done locally, which is an excellent opportunity to reach communities
- Government procurement is one of the most promising area for triggering WBEs and foster economic empowerment of women
- A reform of procurement laws is desired to enable women to prosper
- Targeted measures are needed to ensure that women-owned enterprises are informed of public procurement opportunities

Meg Jones, Chief, Economic Empowerment, UN Women

- All topics proposed for the Forum are among the priorities of high-level panel on women’s economic empowerment (WEE). UN Secretary-General realizes that the only way to achieve SDGs is to address the barriers that prevent WEE
- The NGO CSW Geneva works with organisations that do work on the ground, but usually do not think about Government Procurement (GP) as a way to foster Government Expenditure (GE), so **“Action must be taken – now – by all of you”**
- Government Procurement offers magnitude of possibilities

- Public Procurement can benefit from growth of GDP in Switzerland (2%), given the share of GE and GDP constant
- McKinsey study says that the share of GE and GDP can increase up to 26%, so women have to take these opportunities to do business
- Government practice on public procurement should be changed in formal and informal sectors to help women to do business in a better way (examples of Ukraine and Fiji have to inspire other countries to follow and to share ideas)
- UN Women has worked on public procurement with government in Kenya to support women to access government tenders and to help women satisfy administrative conditions. Pilot project: www.agpo.go.ke
 - Government is the biggest spender in the economy – and thereby best placed to support growth of enterprises led by women, youth and persons with disabilities
 - 30% of annual government expenditure is set aside for women, youth and persons with disabilities
 - Government gives an opportunity to women, prequalifying youth and persons with disabilities to gain access to its tenders that amount to billions each year
 - AGPO training for over 1000 women entrepreneurs in Kenya had a lot of success, and has imperatively to be spread on country level
 - Awareness of public procurement offices through government action is equally important to create new opportunities for women entrepreneurs

See video: UN WOMEN Sensitization on Access to Government Procurement Opportunities (AGPO): <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pLcpRKnpP7c>

Vanessa Erogbogbo, Head of the women and trade program, International Trade Center (ITC)

- #SheTrades initiative: champions of 7 global actions for women's empowerment: (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=odxOp5ZiMy4>)
 1. Champion. Quality data
 2. Enact. Fair policy
 3. **Secure. Government contracts**
 4. Strike. Business deals
 5. Enable. Market access
 6. Unlock. Financial services
 7. Grant. Ownership rights



- Market failures because of issues highlighted in HLP video (90% of economies at least have one legal impediment for participation of women in government procurement), that is why we have to encourage the governments to take the specific measures
- Objective 2020 is to connect 1 million women to markets
- Intervention of governments with transitional measures (e.g. Reform of legislation in procurement) is needed to assure **inclusiveness** that is the driver of government procurement
- Reforming the legislation of public procurement of goods and services (deepest level of public market), governments are in the advantaged position of addressing other policies indirectly, such as those towards improvement of entrepreneurship, sustainability and poverty eradication
- Taking into account the 17 **SDGs**, especially 5 and 8, policy makers can contribute directly through the inclusion of inclusive provisions in national regulation on public procurement to distribute public resources more efficiently and to leverage the participation and sustainability of SMEs, women-owned enterprises and youth among others
- There is a need for transparent and inclusive policies and mechanisms in public procurement to stimulate *supplier diversity* which results in: economic growth, social development and equality, innovation through new products, services and solutions, competition, diverse pool of suppliers
- A directive for public procurement officers and public institutions is mandatory to follow and adjust according to particular needs
- Channel efforts, policy initiatives and public budget are necessary to achieve SDGs towards government procurement as a tool of public policy

ITC works on Government procurement by:

- Promoting **preferential treatment** through some good practices that can be replicated to other countries:
 - Botswana has the reservation schemes for disadvantaged women's communities
 - In India, the Government has reserved all items of handloom textiles for exclusive purchase from some associations, including the Women's Development Organization (WDO)
 - In Kenya, 30% of its procurement is spent for purposes of procuring goods and services from micro and small enterprises owned by youth, women and persons with disabilities
- **Open information** is a key, so ITC set up a portal (<http://procurementmap.intracen.org>) to inform on more than 150.000 daily public tenders in the world and specific legislation for WBEs
- **Training** (<http://learning.intracen.org>) is important to increase the role of women in the economy and to improve the situation of women-owned businesses by using government procurement
- **Connectivity (SheTrades Platform)** is crucial in order to link government and companies and it gives a visibility, networking and matchmaking
- Tracking capability to monitor progress is equally mandatory

Tetiana Lisovska, Head of Division of the Public Procurement Regulation Department of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine – PowerPoint presentation available on <http://www.ngocsw-geneva.ch/home/one-day-forum-on-the-economic-empowerment-of-women-girls-10-october-2016>

ProZorro Ukraine's experience of eProcurement reform (<https://prozorro.gov.ua/en/>)

- Ukraine's procurement market is huge, but has been associated for a long time with corruption (at least 50B UAH (ca. 2.2B USD) per annum – losses from corruption and limited competition)
- **Ukraine's accession to the WTO GPA** was one of the mechanisms to build up a transparent, open and competitive public procurement system that would comply with international standards and would be trusted by various stakeholders
- eProcurement system ProZorro developed in a year (pilot project in April 2016), with good results:
 - More than 13% savings on completed procedures
 - 2,77 average number of bids
 - 115 k tenders
 - 5810 contracting authorities
 - 18911 suppliers
- "Golden triangle of partnership" is in the core of procurement
 - Government: "the rules", professionalization and data storage
 - Commercial platforms: CAs & suppliers, acquiring and service
 - Civil Society: monitoring and control of procurement
- Ukraine won the **World Procurement Award** in the Public Sector nomination
 - ProZorro considered by EBRD as a recommended model for eProcurement reform
 - National Council of Reforms recognized PP reform as the most successful one
 - ProZorro is a showcase & learning project of the Open Contracting Partnership
- There are several advantages of ProZorro:
 - Low initial cost (open source) - so can be used in other countries
 - Low implementation and maintenance cost (cost shared with platforms)
 - Better services (including training & legal support) due to competition among platform providers
 - Higher suppliers competition due to involvement of existing pools of suppliers registered on commercial platforms
 - Higher resistance to corruption due to distribution of risk among various actors
 - Additional statistical & risk-management tools (as for example, automatic screening of a number of factors) allow to identify corruption-prone tenders
 - Application of Open Contracting Data Standard
 - Alignment with international legislation standards
- New official web-portal with "Google"-like search, bi.prozorro.org, provides all available information in a user-friendly format
- ProZorro has become a label for change of companies' attitudes to women's participation in tender (50%)



Swiss administration promotes gender equality in public procurement by 5 pillars:

1. **Legal basis** in the context of federal procurement
 - Federal Act on Public Procurement (art. 8)
 - Ordinance on Public Procurement (art. 6))
2. **Declaration by the supplier** (2016): companies and first-level contractors have to provide information on the way they respect equal pay
3. **A governmental tool to monitor the compliance with wage equality (Logib Controls):** www.logib.ch
 - Logib has been developed by the FOGE to assess whether the pay practice of an organisation with 50 or more employees respects gender equality
 - It uses the OLS regression analysis with variables similar to those of the Swiss Earnings Structure Survey and a tolerance threshold of 5%
 - Logib is based on Excel, so can be used locally, free of charges and does not require any statistical or IT know how
 - It is recognised as good practice, adapted by Finland, France, Germany, Lichtenstein, Poland, Portugal and the United Kingdom
 - There are 5 easy steps to determine where a company stands on wage equality
4. **Controls of wage equality in federal procurement**
 - The FOGE has controlled the respect of wage equality between women and men in federal procurement since 2006 (57 controls observed: 25 – no systematic discrimination, 24 - problems observed, 8 - violation of the conditions to participate in Federal public procurement)
 - The procedure of these controls has been defined in accordance with the Swiss Federal Procurement Conference
 - The controls are conducted according to the four eyes principle
 - Companies are randomly selected by the FOGE and asked to send wage information for all employees; then inspectors come with questions. If conditions are not respected, a company will have 12 months to improve, without permission to conduct a tender
 - Legal consequences and sanctions are applicable when wage discrimination is observed
5. **Charter on equal pay for the public sector**
 - The charter has been developed by the FOGE and signed in September 2016 by the government as well as 25 cantons and municipalities
 - Among other actions, signatories are committed to enforce, within public procurement and/or subsidies, wage equality by introducing control mechanisms.



Conclusion & Recommendations

- A reform of legislation in procurement and specific measures are needed in most countries to ensure better access of WBEs to public procurement opportunities
- Government expenditure of public procurement should be exercised in a way to help WBEs to benefit from procurement practices
- Intervention of governments with transitional measures can help to women and other vulnerably groups to gain procurement markets and to assure inclusiveness
- A transparent, open and competitive public procurement system is mandatory to increase women's participation in procurement markets
- E-procurement and e-controls open opportunities for all countries that are reforming now
- Most companies are willing to collaborate in order to demonstrate that they respect the law and to maintain fair competition in public procurement
- Monitoring equal pay in public procurement constitutes a powerful leverage to lead companies to question the neutrality of their pay system as well as the other mechanisms that contribute to define employees salaries
- There is a limit in legal entity for monitoring of headquarters and subsidiary companies

Panel on Equal Pay between Men & Women

Moderator: **Mary Farmer**, Professor, Leading Women program, Copenhagen Business School

Panelists:

- **Pascal Vielle**, Professor of Law, Université de Louvain & Scientific Collaborator, Université Libre de Bruxelles
- **Sonja Hönig Schough**, President Zonta International and Zonta International Foundation
- **Véronique Goy Veenhuys**, Founder & CEO, EQUAL-SALARY Foundation
- **Raquel Blanc**, VP Diversity & Inclusion, Philip Morris International

Rapporteur: **Laetitia Tierny**, Manager Diversity & Inclusion, Philip Morris International

Context

Women make up about half of the world population, drive 70 to 80% of all consumer purchasing and are increasingly present in the workforce. The principle of equal pay for men and women is enshrined in the legislation of the majority of countries. However, the reality is that inequity in pay still remains between men and women around the world. On average, women have to work almost one year and 3 months to earn the same salary as men do in only one year. Worldwide, the pay gap stands at an average of 23% and even in the European Union, it is estimated to be 16%. In today's modern world, above average pay gaps can still reach an astounding 27% as is currently the case in Japan.

Despite showing important progress, this topic has at least received a lot of momentum these past ten years, becoming a hot topic in the press and on Social Media, putting pressure on legislators to address it. Many world leaders have publicly expressed their concern over the issue and the huge economic implications of this inequity.

Our four panelists discussed some of the concepts, aspects and solutions that can be undertaken by different key actors.

Concepts behind the Gender Pay Gap

When talking about the gender pay gap, it is essential to differentiate two notions: **pay equity and pay equality**.

- The pay equity refers to the difference of men wages' average with women wages' average. It is expressed as a percentage of men wages. For instance, worldwide women earn 77% of what men earn as per the ILO estimation.
- The pay equality refers to a legal aspect usually punishable by law which is to pay women less than men for either the same work or work of equal value. This is called discrimination and contributes to enlarge the pay inequity.

Work of Equal Value

By «work of equal value», ones needs to understand the value that comes out of different types of work. For instance, the value brought on one side by engineers that are mainly men and, on the other side by social affairs directors that are mainly women can be considered as similar. In reality, it is unfortunately not often the case and this is then reflected in wage inequality. Hence, women and men are still working in different jobs and sectors. Unfortunately, the ones women usually work in are generally less paid and undervalued, often by “tradition” and not based on a sturdy evaluation of the work value.

Hence, the «work of equal value» concept is used to determinate if there is a discrimination in men versus women jobs when they:

- Are done in different conditions,
- Require different qualifications or skills,
- Require different levels of efforts,
- Imply different levels of responsibilities,
- Are executed in different places, companies or employers.

Gender Pay Gap Inequity

When analyzing the gender pay gap, there is usually a part that can be explained by the type of job, education or other factors and then there is an unexplained part that refers to pay inequality or discrimination. In many countries, if we remove the unexplained part, women would earn more than men, e.g. Sweden, Lithuania, Brazil or Russia. Moreover, interestingly, the gender pay gap increases when looking at women at higher levels.

The pay inequity can vary depending if it is calculated based on hourly, monthly or yearly salary. Hourly, the gap is usually smaller, one of the main reasons is that women do a lot of “unpaid” work such as domestic or family caring activities. Moreover, the gender pay gap increases when women experience a maternity break. Other factors leading to pay inequity include: part time work, horizontal and vertical segregation, education, professional experience, nationality, age, and many others.



Pay equality is about social justice and represents a human right recognized by the ILO as one of the four most important social rights. It is an enabler to improve women and children situations in the world, for instance by decreasing poverty or reducing child labor. It allows to increase companies’ productivity and competitiveness by attracting and retaining the best talent. Finally, closing the gender pay gap gives greater profitability to the economy as a whole. Research shows that discrimination leads to negative economic consequences and slows down world development. In Switzerland where the pay gap is around 15%, the economic loss impact is estimated to be CHF 7.7 billion per year for the country.

Close the Gap

To close the gap, it is essential to act on several different fronts:

- Legislations and labor conventions to:
 - Take positive action to fight against social segregation
 - Regulate part time work
 - Act on elements influencing unpaid work, e.g. parental leave, working time, childcare
- Gender mainstreaming through:
 - The Beijing action platform (initiated by country states)
 - Empowering women through service and advocacy as organizations like Zonta International are doing.
 - Dialogue among social partners i.e. employers and unions regarding: occupation or function ponderations, job evaluations, analytic classification of functions, correction of inequalities, and many other elements that are critical to wage determination.
- Companies actions:
 - By taking their social responsibility seriously and entering into third party certifications or audit processes such as the EQUAL-SALARY certification.

Concrete examples of actions – See also the PowerPoint Presentations available on <http://www.ngocsw-geneva.ch/home/one-day-forum-on-the-economic-empowerment-of-women-girls-10-october-2016>

Zonta International

Zonta International is an active leading global organization of professionals empowering women through service and advocacy. With 30,000 members in 66 countries, Zonta international envisions a world in which women's rights are recognized as human rights and every woman is able to achieve their full potential. In such a world, women have access to all resources and are represented in decision-making positions on an equal basis with men. In such a world, no woman lives in fear of violence or is paid unequally. Examples of initiatives they conduct include job evaluation research, education programs, scholarships and awards.



EQUAL-SALARY certification

External certifications provide a practical solution for companies to validate internal pay practices and check if they pay equally, regardless of gender. In fact, while most companies claim to pay men and women the same, it is difficult to verify and prove. Undeniably, saying it doesn't have much value unless endorsed by a third party independent body. The Swiss non-profit Foundation EQUAL-SALARY is a solid actor in this field as it has established a certification procedure and methodology which is recognized by the Swiss Confederation, Swiss Federal Court and the European Commission. It follows the systematic approach of ISO 9000 standards (quality management systems) and is composed of a statistical analysis involving external verification of all employees' salaries as well as a thorough audit process. The audit process is conducted by the international auditing and certifying company SGS as well as PwC. The Foundation has already undertaken 40 procedures of certification since its creation in 2010.



The Swiss non-profit Foundation EQUAL-SALARY is a solid actor in this field as it has established a certification procedure and methodology which is recognized by the Swiss Confederation, Swiss Federal Court and the European Commission. It follows the systematic approach of ISO 9000 standards (quality management systems) and is composed of a statistical analysis involving external verification of all employees' salaries as well as a thorough audit process. The audit process is conducted by the international auditing and certifying company SGS as well as PwC. The Foundation has already undertaken 40 procedures of certification since its creation in 2010.

EQUAL-SALARY certification – the example of Philip Morris

In 2015, Philip Morris International was the first multinational to receive the equal-salary certification in Switzerland. Following this milestone, the company embarked on a certification procedure in Japan and obtained it in September 2016. This marked the first time the EQUAL-SALARY Foundation certified a company outside of Switzerland. It proves that the equal-salary methodology can be used in any country. Philip Morris International's leading goal is now to certify an increasing number of markets and pave the way in making this certification become a worldwide recognized label for equal pay. The company believes that its contribution to equal pay awareness can significantly and genuinely support in narrowing the pay gap and improve economic conditions for over half of the world's population (watch video on <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=30tgCtcNLJU>)



For Philip Morris International, the key benefits of obtaining such a third-party certification includes but are not limited to: internally and externally raising awareness on this important topic, increasing employees' engagement, enhancing employer branding as well as optimizing talent retention and acquisition. Ultimately, it supports the progress in having gender balance across the organization.

**We all have a role to play, engage in equal pay:
become an EQUAL-SALARY AMBASSADOR AND/OR A MEMBER OF ZONTA**

Panel on Addressing Unpaid Care Work

Convener & Moderator: **Valerie Bichelmeier**, Main UN Representative, Make Mothers Matter (MMM)

Panelists:

- **Valeria Esquivel**, Senior Advisor, Social Policy and Gender, Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO)
- **Paola Panzeri**, Senior Policy and Advocacy officer for Employment, Gender equality & Migration, COFACE – Families Europe
- **Antoine de Gabrielli**, Founder & CEO Companieros, Founder Happy Men Network
- **Zahrah Nesbitt-Ahmed**, Research Fellow, Institute for Development Studies (IDS)

Rapporteurs: **Valerie Bichelmeier & Karen Thorsen**, Make Mothers Matter (MMM)

Summary and Recommendations from the panel

The inclusion of target 5.4 in the 2030 Agenda finally places the issue of unpaid family care work on the political agenda, and commits governments to address this issue as a major barrier to women's economic empowerment and gender equality.

→ Progress in recognizing, reducing and redistributing unpaid family care work requires care policies spanning multiple sectors that include education, health, social protection and labour.

→ Labour, women's and social organisations should all come together to push for that issue and engage with governments to devise a coherent set of care policies with a gender perspective.

→ Work life balance (WLB) policies should be part of care policies to redistribute work between men and women both in the workplace and at home. In particular these policies should aim at keeping women at work, and support their re-entry into the work force after career breaks linked to maternity or elder care – so that the gender pension gap and women's poverty in old age can be reduced.

→ To be effective, WLB policies must be a mix of different elements – like a puzzle. No single policy will be enough to address the various situations and needs of families all along the life cycle.

→ An idea put forward with the “Happy Men” Networks is to start involving men for Gender Equality and a more equal sharing of responsibilities at work, before talking about more equal sharing of care at home. Both men and women aspire to a better balance between work and family/personal lives.

The Happy Men network allow men to freely share their frustrations and to become aware of their overinvestment in their career to the detriment of their personal, family and social lives. Once they realize that they are not alone, they are ready to make change. The key is also to convince middle managers to promote Gender Equality at work, based on 3 arguments:

- Diversity results in better performances
- Not promoting women in management position is a huge waste of talents

→ Care must be made visible at all levels and its value underlined and celebrated in order to counteract harmful social norms. This can be achieved through various means such as “Discourse Saturation”, statistics, Audio-Visual strategies, etc. Audio-visual Strategies makes use of all the media to raise awareness among the general public, i.e. women themselves, their husbands and community members as key stakeholders, in order to make them aware of the issue and change their attitudes towards harmful practices of stereotyping women's roles

Introduction by Valerie Bichelmeier, Main UN Representative, Make Mothers Matter (MMM), Panel convener and moderator

→ The statement made on International Women’s Day 2014 by Magdalena Sepulveda, then UN Special Rapporteur on Extreme Poverty and Human Rights well summarizes the issue:

“Women’s economic empowerment is a mirage if we don’t also take into account the unpaid work they are doing in the home. In most countries, women – especially those living in poverty - work longer hours than men when unpaid work is taken into account, yet they receive lower earnings and less recognition.



Heavy and unequal care responsibilities are a norm that is taken for granted and stand as a major barrier to gender equality, taking up women’s time and denying their equal enjoyment of the rights to education, decent work, health and participation in government, among others.

Unpaid care work such as cooking, cleaning and caring for children and the elderly entrenches women’s poverty and social exclusion when it is not socially recognized and shared. [...]

Unpaid care work is at the foundation of our societies, and it is crucial for economic growth and social development. However, it has been largely overlooked or taken for granted by policy makers.

For the sake of human rights and equitable, sustainable development, we cannot afford to ignore unpaid care work [...]

→ The 2030 development Agenda recognizes this issue and includes a target on unpaid care work under SDG 5 on gender equality:



“Recognize and value unpaid care and domestic work through the provision of public services, infrastructure and social protection policies and the promotion of shared responsibility within the household and the family as nationally appropriate” (Target 5.4)

→ Note that in Switzerland, Time Use Surveys have been conducted very regularly every 3 or 4 years over the past 20 years (see www.bfs.admin.ch/bfs/en/home/statistics/work-income/unpaid-work.html). Based on the latest survey in 2013, the financial value of unpaid care work was estimated at 400 billion francs, which represent 41.4 % of Swiss GDP, which is more than significant; 61% of this work is done by women.

Dr Valeria Esquivel, Senior Advisor, Social Policy and Gender, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO).

Valeria contributed to the UNRISD 2016 Flagship Report, “Policy Innovations for Transformative Change” (available on www.unrisd.org/flagship2016), in particular to Chapter 3 on “Care policies: realizing their transformative potential”

→ Target 5.4 is a big success: it brings care on the international agenda, and it opens the door for women’s organisations to hold governments accountable at national level:

- Target 5.4 goes well beyond the commitments of the 1995 Beijing platform of Action, which was limited to recognition: it is also about public infrastructure and social policies supporting redistribution and reduction of women’s unpaid care work.

- It also has a strong social justice perspective: among women themselves, it is the poorest women who are most impacted by unpaid care work as they most suffer from the resulting time poverty
 - With Target 5.4 Care becomes a public policy issue and moves beyond the private sphere
- Care spans several public sectors and should be seen as a crosscutting issue. Care policies notably include education policies (e.g. early childhood education and care), health policy (child and elderly health and care), social policies (e.g. cash transfers to support caregivers), as well as labour policies (e.g. paid maternity leave).

Care Policies:

- should be designed with a gender perspective.
- do not work in isolation but rather complement each other.
- can be transformative when they are multi-sectorial, i.e. when these different sectors come together to devise and implement a coherent set of policies.

→ However, care policies do not emerge from technocrats and do not usually rank high in governments priorities: they are the result of a political process where labour, women's and social organisations all come together to push for that issue.

Paola Panzeri, Senior Policy and Advocacy officer for Employment, Gender equality & Migration, COFACE – Families Europe

→ Care is an issue that is discussed on a daily basis within families across Europe, whether it's about childcare, elderly care, or a simple medical appointment.

→ A recent Eurofound survey shows that when paid and unpaid work is combined, European women work 64 hours per week and men 56. Statistics also show that women's paid work decreases with the number of children, whereas on the contrary, men work more. So the male breadwinner model is still very prevalent in Europe.

→ So the objective of work life balance (WLB) policies is to redistribute work between men and women both in the work place and at home. At the same time, WLB should not be seen as only concerning young parents, or only white-collar workers. WLB should be for all.

→ In particular, due to current demographic changes and the ageing of the European population there is a so-called "sandwich generation" of women aged 45-50+ who have to care both for their grand children and their elderly parents. It is important to support these women to stay in employment so that they don't fall into poverty in old age.

→ In the EU there is a 40% Pension Gap between men and women, which is much higher than the 16% Gender Pay Gap. This huge Pension Gap is largely due to the fact that women often do not manage to re-enter the labour force after a career break linked to care responsibilities. So the issue is not only to have women enter the labour market, but also stay, and not in low paid part-time jobs.

→ In the past years COFACE brought together partners from civil society, research, governments and employers to devise the "European Reconciliation Package" (ERP), which was published in 2015 (available in several languages on www.coface-eu.org/en/Publications/European-Reconciliation-Package). Reconciliation policies, to be effective, must be a mix of different elements. No single policy will be enough to address the various situations and needs of families all along the life cycle. Rather, as symbolized on the ERP cover, it is like a puzzle with different policies complementing each other in an integrated approach.



→ The ERP is a collection of best practices and recommendations of WLB policies from 4 different perspectives:

- Carers (e.g. giving a legal status to carers and recognizing care work in pension calculations)
- Women at work (coherent legislative framework including maternity, paternity and care leave to promote more equal sharing of care between men and women)
- Reconciliation at the workplace through flexible working conditions
- Childcare education and parenting: availability and affordability of diverse quality childcare options is key for families

→ On 13 September 2016, the European Parliament adopted a resolution on “Creating labour market conditions favourable for work-life balance”. So reconciliation of family and professional life is now rightly high on the EU Agenda.

Antoine de Gabrielli, Founder & CEO Companieros, Founder Happy Men Network – “Happy Men Share More!” (www.happymen.fr) – Powerpoint Presentation available on <http://www.ngocsw-geneva.ch/home/one-day-forum-on-the-economic-empowerment-of-women-girls-10-october-2016>

→ The idea behind the “Happy Men” Networks (or circles) is to start involving men for Gender Equality at work, before talking about more equal sharing of care at home. Happy Men works with businesses which are committed to Gender Equality, but which realize that progress has been stagnating, mainly due to the care issue.



→ Different approaches have been tried to encourage men to be more involved in domestic and care work, but whether based on guilt or well-meaning considerations, none of these has worked.

→ In companies, the commitment of top management is essential, but the key is to convince all the middle managers, and they are many more. 3 arguments can be put forwards for these managers to promote Gender Equality at work:

- Diversity results in better performances
- Not promoting women in management position is a huge waste of talents
- Both men and women aspire to a better balance between work and family/personal lives.

→ 2 levels of action are needed in order to progress:

- Question and review work culture and organisation, as well as managerial practices that suppose that there is spouse at home who takes care of everything
- Convince the men who are in decision making positions to make such organisational, cultural and managerial change happen

→ The Happy Men networks achieve this by establishing men’s only networks where they feel free to speak – because such freedom does not exist in mixed networks. In these circles, men become aware of the issues around gender equality and all quickly agree that it would really be nice if career success and family/personal life could go hand in hand.

→ 70% of men believe that one cannot succeed without sacrificing one’s personal, family and social life. Freedom of speech in the circles allows men to express their frustrations – for example of not seeing their children grow up or not spending enough time with their spouse. They also become aware of their overinvestment in their career to the detriment of their personal and social lives. And once they realize that they all share those frustrations, they are ready to make changes.

→ Practically, there will be 47 Happy Men circles in France by the end of 2016. Happy Men circles will also soon be launched in Switzerland. The idea is to train men to run those circles, which typically meet once

every 2 months or so. The Happy Men networks also largely benefitted from the use of Twitter and the interest of the media that helped propagating the idea.

→ The Happy Men networks do not solve everything, but they are one piece of the puzzle.

Dr. Zahrah Nesbitt-Ahmed, Research Fellow, Institute for Development Studies (IDS) – PowerPoint: <http://www.ngocsw-geneva.ch/home/one-day-forum-on-the-economic-empowerment-of-women-girls-10-october-2016>

IDS platform with resources on Unpaid Care Work: <http://interactions.eldis.org/unpaid-care-work>

IDS has conducted a 4 year research project in 6 countries (Bangladesh, Indonesia, Kenya, Nepal, Nigeria and Uganda) in order to look into the conditions under which unpaid care work is taken into account into policy.

→ The recognition and valuing of care work, both paid and unpaid, is fundamental to achieving gender equality for women and girls. The impact that Unpaid Care Work has on Women's access to Education, health services and decent work needs to be better understood. A first issue observed is that there is no definition or proper understanding of Unpaid Care Work at policy level.

→ We need to celebrate care as valuable: advocacy efforts at both the national policy level and also within communities need to make care visible and underline its value in order to counteract harmful social norms.

→ There are different strategies to advance on Recognition

- 'Discourse Saturation' approach, i.e. seeking out and exploiting opportunities to talk about the issue, especially at spaces not normally linked with unpaid care work
- Raising the profile of unpaid care work in strategic high-level policy spaces
- Statistics and Alternative Data Collection Methods
- Audio-visual strategies
- Papers and Conferences

→ Audio-visual Strategies includes use of media (newspapers, radio and television) adverts and talk shows targeting the general public, i.e. women themselves, their husbands and community members as key stakeholders, in order to make them aware of the issue and change their attitudes towards harmful practices of stereotyping women's roles.

→ For example in Bangladesh, IDS and its partner used among others a photo exhibition to raise awareness on the issue, which was based on a workshop organized on masculinities and care work. As a result of all the advocacy work on recognition, Unpaid Care Work was included in the National Action Plan for Women, which was developed by the Ministry of Women and children's affairs. IDS also worked with the National office of statistics to develop a survey module that captures men and women's time use for paid and unpaid work.

→ Another example of audio-visual strategy is the short video "Who Cares: Unpaid care work, poverty and women's / girl's human rights" which was created to explain and raise awareness on the issue of unpaid family care work.

(<http://www.ids.ac.uk/news/who-cares-unpaid-care-work-poverty-and-women-s-human-rights>)



Closing Remarks

Ms. Sylvie Durrer, Director, Swiss Federal Office for Gender Equality (FOGE)



Women's economic empowerment



Some thoughts about...

- Women's economic empowerment is essential to achieve human rights.
- Economic empowerment is not only about economy, it is about dignity, autonomy and self-determination. It has to do with the capacity to represent ones own interests in a responsible and self-determined way, acting one's own authority.
- It has to do with human rights and in the same time with well-being, in an individual perspective but also in a collective perspective.
- When governments, businesses and communities work to eliminate inequalities, countries are less likely to be plagued by poverty and insecurity.

Bern, Switzerland, March 2015
12,000 people from across Switzerland took part in demonstration outside the parliament calling on the government to implement equal pay principles



- 1) Legal situation
- 2) A few facts and figures
- 3) Examples of measures and tools
- 4) Strong political will
- 5) Continuous personal commitment

Download Full PowerPoint Presentation

<http://www.ngocsw-geneva.ch/home/one-day-forum-on-the-economic-empowerment-of-women-girls-10-october-2016>





About the NGO CSW Geneva

*Established at the dawn of the 1st UN World Conference on Women of 1975, the **NGO Committee on the Status of Women, Geneva** brings together UN representatives of more than 40 international NGOs in consultative relationship with the United Nations, working together to advocate for women's rights, women's empowerment and gender equality. The NGO CSW Geneva has a long history working on women's rights: it was an active participant in all 4 UN World Conferences on Women, and a key contributor to the 1995 Beijing Conference and its landmark outcome document, the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action. The Committee has also subsequently organized, in close collaboration with the UN ECE, NGO Forums for the UN ECE regional reviews of Beijing+5, Beijing+10 and Beijing+15 and Beijing+20. The later, organized over 3 days in November 2014 under the motto "act advance achieve women's rights", has attracted more than 700 participants from 50 countries.*

More information: www.ngocsw-geneva.ch.

Forum Organizing Committee

- Simone Ovar (ZONTA International), NGO CSW Geneva President & Chair of the Forum
- Anne Riz (Federation of American Women's Clubs Overseas - FAWCO), NGO CSW Geneva Treasurer
- Elisa Gazzotti (Soka Gakkai International - SGI), NGO CSW Geneva Secretariat
- Angelamaria Loreto (Ius Primi Viri - IPV), NGO CSW Geneva Vice-President
- Catherine Bosshart (International Federation of Business & Professional Women), NGO CSW Geneva Vice-President & Convener, Panel on Women in decision-making positions
- Véronique Goy Veenhuys (Fondation EQUAL-SALARY), Convener, Panel on Equal pay between men and women
- Valerie Bichelmeier (Make Mothers Matter - MMM), Convener panel on Unpaid Care Work
- Oleksandra Kunovska Mondoux (World Federation of Ukrainian Women's Organizations): Convener, Panel on Government procurement

Contact: forum@ngocsw-geneva.ch